

**CHILD CARE LICENSING ADVISORY COMMITTEE  
MEETING MINUTES**

14 November 2013  
Cannon Health Building, Room 125  
288 North 1460 West  
Salt Lake City, UT

---

**Members Present:** Dale Smith, Carol Thompson, Ed Dieringer, Pat Marino, Julie Shakib, Tracey Brown, Joni Hemond, Heidi Radeke, and Diane Wilkinson.

**Members Excused:**

**Members Absent:** Jodi Jensen

**Department of Health and Child Care Licensing Staff Present:** Harper Randall, Teresa Whiting, Simon Bolivar, Donna Thomas, Jessica Strout, Karrie Phillips, Joan Isom, Sue Kirkham, Sarah Atherton, Kathleen Westover, and Colleen Murphy.

---

**WELCOME**

At 9:38 a.m., Mr. Smith started the meeting by welcoming the committee members and members of the public.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

Minutes from the September meeting were approved via e-mail by Mr. Dieringer, Mr. Smith, Dr. Shakib, Ms. Thompson, Ms. Brown, Ms. Wilkinson, and Mr. Marino.

**OLD BUSINESS**

**Utah Private Child Care Association letter - subcommittee proposal and public input**

Mr. Smith gave a summary of the events that led to the formation of the subcommittee. He explained that several child care center owners had asked the committee to look at amending licensing rules pertaining to ratios, group size, and square footage. They felt amending these rules would allow them to compete with license-exempt programs. A sub-committee was formed to study the issues and bring a proposal to the committee.

Mr. Dieringer presented the sub-committee's proposal that an optional ratio, group size, and square footage requirement be allowed in a classroom with a highly qualified lead teacher (one with a CDA, a CCP, or an equivalent credential). In these classrooms the ratios and group sizes could be increased by 25% and the square footage requirement could be decreased by 25%.

He listed the ways in which the committee felt this proposal would help center owners and read

the number of states with higher ratio requirements than the present ratio requirements and the number of states with ratio requirements that are the same or higher than those in the proposal.

Ms. Tilley (center owner) presented several visual representations of the differences between current square footage requirements and the proposed square footage requirements.

Mr. Anderson (UPCCA representative) showed a video of a classroom with 15 four-year-old children and a video of a classroom with 19 four-year-old children.

Mr. Smith asked for input from the committee members and the public.

Dr. Shakib and Dr. Hemond questioned the lack of evidence based research that showed a correlation between increased education levels of staff and the quality of care. Mr. Dieringer replied that education is a part of many licensing requirements, including physician's licensing.

Ms. Thompson expressed concern about the stress levels of staff asked to care for more children.

Mr. Marino, Ms. Radeke, and Mr. Dieringer repeated their support of the proposal.

Ms. Wilkins stated she could see both benefits and risks of the proposal.

Ms. Tilley and Mr. Anderson previously spoke in support of the proposal.

Ms. Atherton (Center Lead Licensing Specialist) clarified that the only areas not included when measuring indoor space are bathrooms, closets, staff lockers, hallways, corridors, lobbies, kitchens, and staff offices. She also explained that a maximum capacity for the facility and a maximum capacity for each room/area is calculated.

Ted Black (chief deputy at state Fire Marshall office) went over the fire code for day cares.

Several members of the public, including Victoria Wade (center director), Patrice Isabella (Department of Health, EPIC Program, employee), Alda Jones, Barbara Black (Children's Center employee), Harper Randall (Department of Health employee) Sheila Anderson (UAEYC), Lynn Curtis (center owner), and Veronica Nelson (center owner) expressed their concerns and opposition to the proposal.

After all input and discussion, Mr. Dieringer re-read the sub-committee's proposal to assure clarity of the motion:

1. During regular childcare hours, licensed child care facilities will be held to the current standard of staff to child care ratios when staff education per age group does not meet the educational standards of #2.
2. Required education standards for all teachers and employment status for lead teacher in each age group room:
  - a. All teachers of a given age group/room must have evidence of 25 annual training hours (15 face to face, 10 other means) in accordance with current licensing education requirements.
  - b. The lead teacher of a given age group/room must have evidence of training equivalent to a CDA, CCP, Career Ladder Level 4, or greater.

- c. The group size will increase proportionately for that specific age group/room.
  - d. There will be evidence of a FTE (full time equivalent) hours of lead teacher time involved with the age group. With consideration for typical instances of teacher illness, regularly scheduled vacations, or staff turnover.
3. Optional maximum staff to child ratios for qualifying classrooms:
- a. Less than 1 yo:           5       Grp: 10
  - b. 1yo:                       5       Grp: 10
  - c. 2yo:                       9       Grp: 18
  - d. 3yo:                       15      Grp: 30
  - e. 4yo:                       19      Grp: 38
  - f. 5 yo and up:           25      Grp: 50

Mr. Smith called for vote of committee members. Three were in favor of the proposal and five were opposed.

Ms. Radeke then made a motion that the advisory committee work on making changes to the license exempt statute. The motion was seconded by Mr. Dieringer. The committee all voted in favor of the motion. It was decided that a sub-committee, chaired by Mr. Dieringer, be formed to write a position paper and develop a strategy to get the existing license exempt statute changed.

## **AGENCY REPORTS**

### **Care About Child Care**

In the final minutes of the meeting, Mr. Matherly announced that there will be more grants offered by the Office of Child Care, with some of those being environmental quality grants. He added that providers can contact their local Care About Child Care (Resource and Referral) agencies for more information about these grants.

Mr. Smith adjourned the meeting at 12:00 a.m.

The next meeting is Jan. 9, 2014 from 9:30 - 12:00 in Room 128 of the Cannon Health Building at 288 North 1460 West in Salt Lake City